Subject: Re: Curious Keywords

Posted by davidf on Thu, 27 Feb 1997 08:00:00 GMT

View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

JD Smith writes in a follow-up to this thread:

- > The question is really about the mechanism of Keyword Checking for built-ins
- > vs. non-built-ins. That is, if *I* wrote a routine that took the "THICK"
- > keyword, a user could pass an undefined value through THICK and I would never
- > know that he did. I could not use n_elements() or keyword_set() or any other
- > mechanism I know of to discern in any way that he has used "THICK". And so,
- > consequently, I would not be able to issue an error message in the case he
- > passed an undefined variable. It is as if he never passed it at all! Not so
- > for Plot and other built-in routines (for *some* of their keywords). They
- > somehow "know" that I used e.g., "THICK", even when I pass them an undefined
- > variable.

>

- > My point was that this would be a useful feature to have (although it would
- > possibly result in some subtle and harmful programmatic issues). For
- > instance, if I pass a variable through a keyword into which I'd like to put
- > the result of some calculation, I have to give that variable a value before
- > passing it, in order to test whether to go through the bother of doing the
- > calculation at all. There are, of course, other ways to do this (e.g.
- > optional *parameters*), but I've found myself wishing for this particular
- > mechanism on some occassions, when the other techniques had limitations.

JD is absolutely right about this. You cannot tell in an IDL procedure if a keyword is *used* or not. You can only tell if the argument to the keyword is *defined* or not.

(Most of the programs I look at, by the way, mistakenly think this is what KEYWORD_SET is doing for them. Sigh...)

Since knowing if a keyword is *used* is often quite useful for exactly the reasons JD mentions, I think it should be added to IDL. Obviously IDL knows if the keyword is being used.

I think, if I remember correctly, that PV-Wave has a function entitled KEYWORD_USED (or something like it) that does this very thing.

Cheers!		
David		
David Fanning, Ph.D.		

Fanning Software Consulting
2642 Bradbury Court, Fort Collins, CO 80521

Phone: 970-221-0438 Fax: 970-221-4762

E-Mail: davidf@dfanning.com

Coyote's Guide to IDL Programming: http://www.dfanning.com
