Subject: Re: Incorrect fit of elliptic to data
Posted by Craig Markwardt on Mon, 04 Aug 2003 19:29:30 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

"active-news" <johan_marais@absamail.co.za> writes:

> I am using the program from David Fanning's site (FIT_ELLIPS) to fit an
> ellips to edge points detected from profiles but the fitted ellips seems to
> be bigger than the supplied data. Anyone that can help?

(a) you just dumped a big uuencoded file into the newgroup. Why?

(b) you uuencoded the text edges.pro file too. Why?

(c) It was difficult to get your script to work. There was no documentation. Depending on where I clicked, I got different results, I suppose I am supposed to click the center? The logic of the program is complex enough that it is difficult to decide what *should* be happening.

(c) you assumed that Fanning's fit_ellipse function is for fitting elliptical shells, when clearly the examples show solid elliptical disks. That script computes the size of the ellipse based on the moment of inertial of the "blob." Is that what you want?

(d) Have you considered other programs, which actually fit an elliptical contour to XY scatter data? (such as MPFITELLIPSE)

Craig

Subject: Re: Incorrect fit of elliptic to data
Posted by David Fanning on Mon, 04 Aug 2003 19:38:22 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Craig Markwardt writes:

> (a) you just dumped a big uuencoded file into the newgroup. Why?
>
> (b) you uuencoded the text edges.pro file too. Why?
>
> (c) It was difficult to get your script to work. There was no
> documentation. Depending on where I clicked, I got different results,
> I suppose I am supposed to click the center? The logic of the program
> is complex enough that it is difficult to decide what *should* be
> happening.
>

> (c) you assumed that Fanning's fit_ellipse function is for fitting
> elliptical shells, when clearly the examples show solid elliptical
> disks. That script computes the size of the ellipse based on the
> moment of inertial of the "blob." Is that what you want?
>
> (d) Have you considered other programs, which actually fit an
> elliptical contour to XY scatter data? (such as MPFITELLIPSE)

All I know is that if I had to do this technical support
gig for a living, I would charge a hell of a lot more for
it than I do now. :-(

Cheers,

David

--
David W. Fanning, Ph.D.
Fanning Software Consulting, Inc.
Phone: 970-221-0438, E-mail: david@dfanning.com
Coyote's Guide to IDL Programming: http://www.dfanning.com/
Toll-Free IDL Book Orders: 1-888-461-0155

Subject: Re: Incorrect fit of elliptic to data
Posted by active-news on Mon, 04 Aug 2003 21:06:54 GMT
View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

I was thinking that supplying the data and the code in this way would be the
best but I now believe that I made a mistake in doing that, I apologize for
that.

Thank you for recommending your MPFITELLIPSE program, I think that will be
better suited for what I want to do and I will have a look at it.

Johan

"Craig Markwardt" <craigmnet@cow.physics.wisc.edu> wrote in message
news:onznipgr1h.fsf@cow.physics.wisc.edu...
>
> "active-news" <johan_marais@absamail.co.za> writes:
>
>
>> I am using the program from David Fanning's site (FIT_ELLIPS) to fit an
>> ellips to edge points detected from profiles but the fitted ellips seems
to
>> be bigger than the supplied data. Anyone that can help?

>
> (a) you just dumped a big uuencoded file into the newgroup. Why?
>
> (b) you uuencoded the text edges.pro file too. Why?
>
> (c) It was difficult to get your script to work. There was no
> documentation. Depending on where I clicked, I got different results,
> I suppose I am supposed to click the center? The logic of the program
> is complex enough that it is difficult to decide what *should* be
> happening.
>
> (c) you assumed that Fanning's fit_ellipse function is for fitting
> elliptical shells, when clearly the examples show solid elliptical
> disks. That script computes the size of the ellipse based on the
> moment of inertial of the "blob." Is that what you want?
>
> (d) Have you considered other programs, which actually fit an
> elliptical contour to XY scatter data? (such as MPFITELLIPSE)
>
> Craig
